DISCLAIMER

This report has been reviewed by the Office of Air Quality Planning and Standards (OAQPS), U. S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA), and approved for publication. This OAQPS Staff Paper contains the findings and conclusions of the staff of the OAQPS and does not necessarily represent those of the EPA. Mention of trade names or commercial products is not intended to constitute endorsement or recommendation for use.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This Staff Paper is the product of the Office of Air Quality Planning and Standards (OAQPS). For the primary standards, the principal authors include John Bachmann, Dr. Jane C. Caldwell, Patricia D. Koman, Harvey M. Richmond, Eric G. Smith of OAQPS, Dr. Tracey J. Woodruff of the Office of Policy, Planning and Evaluation (OPPE), and Dr. Karen M. Martin of OAQPS who also managed the project. For the secondary standards, principal authors include Rich Damberg, Chebryll Edwards, and Bruce Polkowsky of OAQPS. The authors would like to acknowledge John Haines for his guidance and expertise, and Terence Fitz-Simons, Jonathan Miller, David Mintz, and Miki Wayland for providing expertise and analysis. Finally, the authors wish to acknowledge Tricia Crabtree for providing substantial wordprocessing and general support for the Staff Paper. The Staff Paper includes comments from OAQPS, the Office of Research and Development, OPPE, Regional Offices, and the Office of General Counsel within EPA.

On two different occasions, draft chapters of this document were formally reviewed by the Clean Air Scientific Advisory Committee (CASAC). Helpful comments and suggestions were also submitted by a number of independent scientists, by officials from several State and local air pollution organizations, by environmental groups, by industrial groups, and by individual companies.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| List o | of Table | S | ⁄ii |
|--------|----------|---|-----|
| List | of Figur | es | iii |
| I. | PURI | POSE I | -1 |
| II. | BAC | KGROUND II | -1 |
| | A. | Legislative Requirements | -1 |
| | B. | History of PM NAAQS Reviews | -3 |
| | | 1. Establishment of the NAAQS for Particulate Matter | -3 |
| | | 2. First Review of NAAQS for Particulate Matter | -3 |
| | | 3. Recent Litigation | -4 |
| | | 4. Current Review of the Particulate Matter NAAQS II | |
| III. | APPI | ROACHIII | -1 |
| | A. | Bases for Initial Analytical Assessments | -1 |
| | | 1. Primary Standards | |
| | | 2. Secondary Standards | |
| | B. | Organization of Document | -2 |
| IV. | AIR (| QUALITY: CHARACTERIZATION AND IMPLICATIONS IV | -1 |
| | A. | Characterization of U.S. Ambient Particulate Matter | -1 |
| | | 1. Multi-modal Size Distributions IV | -2 |
| | | 2. Properties of Fine and Coarse Fraction Particles IV | -4 |
| | | a. Sources and Formation Processes IV | -4 |
| | | b. Chemical Composition, Solubility, and Acidity IV | -5 |
| | | c. Atmospheric Behavior | -6 |
| | | d. Correlations Between PM _{2.5} and Coarse Fraction | |
| | | Mass | -7 |
| | | e. Summary IV | -8 |
| | B. | PM Air Quality Patterns | -8 |
| | | 1. PM Concentrations and Trends IV | -8 |
| | | a. PM ₁₀ Concentrations and Trends IV | |
| | | b. Fine Particle Concentrations and Trends IV | |
| | | c. Trends in Emissions of Fine Particle Precursor | - |
| | | Gases | 1 |
| | | 2 Background Levels IV-1 | |

| | C. | Air Q | uality Implications for Interpreting Epidemiological Studies IV-1 | 4 |
|----|------|---------|---|---|
| | | 1. | Representativeness of Central Monitor Measurements | |
| | | | of PM Exposures | 5 |
| | | 2. | PM _{2.5} and PM ₁₀ Comparisons in Areas Relevant to the | |
| | | | Health Studies | 6 |
| | D. | Air Q | uality Implications for Risk Management Strategies IV-1 | |
| V. | CRIT | TICAL : | ELEMENTS IN THE REVIEW OF THE PRIMARY | |
| | STAN | NDARD | V - | 1 |
| | A. | Introd | uction | 1 |
| | B. | Mech | anisms | 2 |
| | C. | | e of Effects | |
| | | 1. | Mortality | |
| | | | a. Mortality from Short-term Exposures to PM V-1 | |
| | | | i. Historical Findings from Community | |
| | | | Epidemiology V-1 | 1 |
| | | | ii. Recent Findings V-1 | |
| | | | iii. Specific Causes of Mortality Associated with PM . V-1 | 3 |
| | | | iv. Experimental Animal Studies V-1 | |
| | | | b. Mortality from Long-term Exposures to PM V-1 | |
| | | | c. Extent of Life Shortening V-1 | 8 |
| | | 2. | Indices of Morbidity Associated with Respiratory and | |
| | | | Cardiovascular Disease | 0 |
| | | | a. Hospital Admissions and Emergency Department Visits V-2 | 0 |
| | | | b. School Absences, Work Loss Days, and Restricted | |
| | | | Activity Days | 1 |
| | | 3. | Altered Lung Function and Symptoms V-2 | |
| | | | a. Effects Related to Short-term Exposures to PM V-2 | |
| | | | i. Community Air Pollution Studies V-2 | |
| | | | ii. Controlled Exposures to Laboratory Aerosols V-2 | |
| | | | b. Effects Related to Long-Term Exposures V-2 | 6 |
| | | 4. | Morphological Damage | 7 |
| | | | a. Acid Aerosols V-2 | 7 |
| | | | b. Silica, Crustal Dusts, and Other PM Components V-2 | 8 |
| | | 5. | Effects on Host Defense Mechanisms V-2 | 9 |
| | D. | Sensit | ive Subpopulations | 1 |
| | | 1. | Individuals with Respiratory and Cardiovascular Disease V-3 | 3 |
| | | 2. | Individuals with Infections V-3 | 4 |
| | | 3. | The Elderly | 4 |
| | | 4. | Children V-3 | 5 |
| | | 5. | Asthmatic Individuals | 5 |
| | | | | |

| | Ε. | Evalua | ation of the Epidemiological Evidence | V-36 |
|---------------------|----------|----------|--|---------------|
| | | 1. | Interpretation of Individual PM Study Results | V-38 |
| | | | a. Model Selection and Specification | V-38 |
| | | | b. Measurement Error | V-39 |
| | | | c. Potential Influence of other Covariates in Short- | |
| | | | Term Studies | V-43 |
| | | | i. Weather | V-44 |
| | | | ii. Confounding by Other Pollutants | V-45 |
| | | 2. | Consistency and Coherence of the Epidemiological Studies | V-54 |
| | | | a. Consistency | V-54 |
| | | | b. Coherence | V-56 |
| | F. | Health | Effects Associated with Fine and Coarse Fraction Particles | V-58 |
| | | 1. | Epidemiological Studies Using Fine Particle Indicators | V-60 |
| | | | a. Short-Term Studies | V-60 |
| | | | b. Long-Term Studies | V-61 |
| | | 2. | Community Studies Comparing Effects of Fine and Coarse | |
| | | | Fraction PM | V-63 |
| | | | a. Short-Term Comparisons | |
| | | | b. Long-Term Comparisons | V-65 |
| | | 3. | Epidemiological Studies of Areas Dominated by Coarse Particles | V-67 |
| | | 4. | Relevant Physicochemical Differences Between Fine and Coarse | |
| | | | Fraction Particles | V-69 |
| | | _ | a. Comparisons of Fine and Coarse Component Toxicity in | |
| | Labora | atory St | tudies | V-69 |
| | | | b. Toxicity of Fine and Coarse Mode Chemical Components | V-71 |
| | | | c. Physical Aspects of Fine and Coarse Particles | V-73 |
| | | _ | d. Deposition in Sensitive Individuals | V-75 |
| | | 5. | Summary and Conclusions | V-76 |
| T / T | DICI | A CCTC | NOR APPARE | T /T 1 |
| VI. | | | SSMENT | VI-1 |
| | A. B. | | al Scope | VI-2 VI-4 |
| | D. | | onents of the Risk Model | |
| | | 1. 2. | Air Quality Information | |
| | | 2. 3. | Concentration-Response Functions | |
| | | 3. 4. | Limitations and Uncertainties | |
| | C. | | Estimates for Philadelphia and Los Angeles Counties | |
| | C. | 1. | Base Case Risk Estimates Associated with "As Is" PM Levels | |
| | | 1. | a. Philadelphia County | |
| | | | b. Los Angeles County | |
| | | | c. Key Uncertainties | |
| | | 2. | Base Case Risk Estimates Upon Attainment of Current Standards | VI-31 |
| | | ۵. | Dase Case INSK Estimates Opon Attainment of Current Standards | v 1-91 |

| | | 3. | Uncertainty Analyses of Estimated Risks Associated with "As Is" |
|------|------|-------|---|
| | | | PM Levels in Philadelphia County and Attaining Current PM ₁₀ |
| | | | Standards in Los Angeles County VI-35 |
| | | | a. Sensitivity Analyses of Individual Key Uncertainties VI-35 |
| | | | b. Integrated Uncertainty Analysis VI-38 |
| | | 4. | Risk Estimates Associated with Alternative PM _{2.5} Standards VI-44 |
| | | | a. Base Case Risk Estimates VI-44 |
| | | | b. Individual Sensitivity Analysis Concerning Air Quality Roll Marks |
| | | | c. Integrated Uncertainty Analysis VI-54 |
| | | 5. | Key Observations from the Risk Analyses VI-58 |
| VII. | STAI | FF CO | NCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS ON PRIMARY |
| | | | VII-1 |
| | Α. | - | uacy of the Current Primary Standards for Particulate Matter VII-2 |
| | B. | | rative PM Indicators and Risk Management Implications VII-4 |
| | ٥. | 1. | PM ₁₀ as Surrogate Indicator for Fine and Coarse Fraction |
| | | _, | Particles VII-4 |
| | | 2. | Alternative Surrogate Indicators for Fine and Coarse Fraction |
| | | | Particles |
| | | | a. Surrogate Indicators for the Fine Fraction of PM_{10} VII-12 |
| | | | b. Surrogate Indicators for the Coarse Fraction of PM ₁₀ VII-16 |
| | | 3. | Staff Conclusions and Recommendations for Particle Indicators VII-17 |
| | C. | Alter | rnative PM _{2.5} Standards for Control of Fine Fraction Particles VII-18 |
| | | 1. | Averaging Time |
| | | | a. Short-term PM _{2.5} Standard VII-19 |
| | | | b. Long-term PM _{2.5} Standard VII-20 |
| | | 2. | Form General Approaches VII-21 |
| | | | a. 24-Hour PM _{2.5} Standard VII-21 |
| | | | b. Annual PM _{2.5} Standard VII-22 |
| | | 3. | Level and Specific Forms VII-22 |
| | | | a. 24-Hour PM _{2.5} Standard VII-24 |
| | | | b. Annual PM _{2.5} Standard VII-32 |
| | D. | Alter | mative PM_{10} Standards for Control of Coarse Fraction Particles VII-37 |
| | | 1. | Averaging Time VII-37 |
| | | 2. | Level and Form for Alternative Averaging Times VII-38 |
| | | | a. Annual PM ₁₀ Standard VII-38 |
| | | | b. 24-Hour PM ₁₀ Standard VII-39 |
| | | 3. | Summary of Coarse Fraction (PM ₁₀) Standard Conclusions and |
| | | | Recommendations VII-40 |
| | E. | Sumi | mary of Key Uncertainties and Research Recommendations VII-41 |
| | F. | Sumi | mary of Staff Recommendations on Primary PM NAAQS |

| A. B. | Effect 1. 2. 3. 4. 5. | uction |
|----------|--|--|
| | 2. 3. 4. 5. Effect 1. | Definition of Visibility and Characterization of Visibility Impairment VIII-2 Significance of Visibility to Public Welfare VIII-3 Mechanisms of and Contributors to Visibility Impairment VIII-3 Background Levels of Light Extinction VIII-5 a. Rayleigh Scattering VIII-6 b. Light Extinction Due to Background Particulate Matter VIII-7 a. Role of Humidity Conditions VIII-7 a. Role of Humidity in Light Extinction VIII-9 b. Significance of Anthropogenic Sources of Fine Particles VIII-10 c. Regional Differences in Specific Pollutant Concentrations VIII-11 d. Regional Variation in Urban Visibility VIII-11 Policy Considerations Pertaining to the Effects of PM on Visibility VIII-12 s of PM on Materials Damage and Soiling VIII-15 Materials Damage VIII-15 a. Effects on Metals VIII-16 b. Effects on Stone VIII-18 d. Effects on Electronics VIII-18 d. Effects on Electronics VIII-19 |
| C. | 2. 3. 4. 5. Effect 1. | of Visibility Impairment VIII-2 Significance of Visibility to Public Welfare VIII-3 Mechanisms of and Contributors to Visibility Impairment VIII-3 Background Levels of Light Extinction VIII-5 a. Rayleigh Scattering VIII-6 b. Light Extinction Due to Background Particulate Matter VIII-6 Overview of Current Visibility Conditions VIII-7 a. Role of Humidity in Light Extinction VIII-9 b. Significance of Anthropogenic Sources of Fine Particles VIII-10 c. Regional Differences in Specific Pollutant Concentrations VIII-11 d. Regional Variation in Urban Visibility VIII-11 Policy Considerations Pertaining to the Effects of PM on Visibility VIII-15 s of PM on Materials Damage and Soiling VIII-15 Materials Damage VIII-15 a. Effects on Metals VIII-16 b. Effects on Stone VIII-18 d. Effects on Electronics VIII-18 |
| C. | 3.4.5.Effect1. | Significance of Visibility to Public Welfare VIII-3 Mechanisms of and Contributors to Visibility Impairment VIII-3 Background Levels of Light Extinction VIII-5 a. Rayleigh Scattering VIII-6 b. Light Extinction Due to Background Particulate Matter VIII-7 a. Role of Current Visibility Conditions VIII-7 a. Role of Humidity in Light Extinction VIII-9 b. Significance of Anthropogenic Sources of Fine Particles VIII-10 c. Regional Differences in Specific Pollutant Concentrations VIII-11 d. Regional Variation in Urban Visibility VIII-11 Policy Considerations Pertaining to the Effects of PM on Visibility VIII-15 s of PM on Materials Damage and Soiling VIII-15 Materials Damage VIII-15 a. Effects on Metals VIII-16 b. Effects on Paint VIII-18 d. Effects on Stone VIII-18 d. Effects on Electronics VIII-18 |
| C. | 3.4.5.Effect1. | Mechanisms of and Contributors to Visibility Impairment VIII-3 Background Levels of Light Extinction VIII-5 a. Rayleigh Scattering VIII-6 b. Light Extinction Due to Background Particulate Matter VIII-6 Overview of Current Visibility Conditions VIII-7 a. Role of Humidity in Light Extinction VIII-9 b. Significance of Anthropogenic Sources of Fine Particles VIII-10 c. Regional Differences in Specific Pollutant Concentrations VIII-11 d. Regional Variation in Urban Visibility VIII-11 Policy Considerations Pertaining to the Effects of PM on Visibility VIII-12 s of PM on Materials Damage and Soiling VIII-15 Materials Damage VIII-15 a. Effects on Metals VIII-16 b. Effects on Stone VIII-18 d. Effects on Electronics VIII-18 |
| C. | 4.5.6.Effect1. | Background Levels of Light Extinction VIII-5 a. Rayleigh Scattering VIII-6 b. Light Extinction Due to Background Particulate Matter VIII-6 Overview of Current Visibility Conditions VIII-7 a. Role of Humidity in Light Extinction VIII-9 b. Significance of Anthropogenic Sources of Fine Particles VIII-10 c. Regional Differences in Specific Pollutant Concentrations VIII-11 d. Regional Variation in Urban Visibility VIII-11 Policy Considerations Pertaining to the Effects of PM on Visibility VIII-12 s of PM on Materials Damage and Soiling VIII-15 Materials Damage VIII-15 a. Effects on Metals VIII-16 b. Effects on Paint VIII-17 c. Effects on Stone VIII-18 d. Effects on Electronics VIII-19 |
| C. | 5.6.Effect1. | a. Rayleigh Scattering |
| C. | 6. Effect 1. | b. Light Extinction Due to Background Particulate Matter VIII-6 Overview of Current Visibility Conditions VIII-7 a. Role of Humidity in Light Extinction VIII-9 b. Significance of Anthropogenic Sources of Fine Particles VIII-10 c. Regional Differences in Specific Pollutant Concentrations VIII-11 d. Regional Variation in Urban Visibility VIII-11 Policy Considerations Pertaining to the Effects of PM on Visibility VIII-12 s of PM on Materials Damage and Soiling VIII-15 Materials Damage VIII-15 a. Effects on Metals VIII-16 b. Effects on Paint VIII-18 c. Effects on Stone VIII-18 d. Effects on Electronics VIII-19 |
| C. | 6. Effect 1. | Overview of Current Visibility Conditions VIII-7 a. Role of Humidity in Light Extinction VIII-9 b. Significance of Anthropogenic Sources of Fine Particles VIII-10 c. Regional Differences in Specific Pollutant Concentrations VIII-11 d. Regional Variation in Urban Visibility VIII-11 Policy Considerations Pertaining to the Effects of PM on Visibility VIII-12 s of PM on Materials Damage and Soiling VIII-15 Materials Damage VIII-15 a. Effects on Metals VIII-16 b. Effects on Paint VIII-17 c. Effects on Stone VIII-18 d. Effects on Electronics VIII-19 |
| C. | 6. Effect 1. | a. Role of Humidity in Light Extinction |
| C. | Effect 1. | b. Significance of Anthropogenic Sources of Fine Particles |
| C. | Effect 1. | Particles |
| C. | Effect 1. | c. Regional Differences in Specific Pollutant Concentrations |
| C. | Effect 1. | Concentrations |
| C. | Effect 1. | d.Regional Variation in Urban VisibilityVIII-11Policy Considerations Pertaining to the Effects of PMVIII-12on VisibilityVIII-12s of PM on Materials Damage and SoilingVIII-15Materials DamageVIII-15a.Effects on MetalsVIII-16b.Effects on PaintVIII-17c.Effects on StoneVIII-18d.Effects on ElectronicsVIII-19 |
| C. | Effect 1. | Policy Considerations Pertaining to the Effects of PM on Visibility |
| C. | Effect 1. | on VisibilityVIII-12s of PM on Materials Damage and SoilingVIII-15Materials DamageVIII-15a. Effects on MetalsVIII-16b. Effects on PaintVIII-17c. Effects on StoneVIII-18d. Effects on ElectronicsVIII-19 |
| C. | 1. | s of PM on Materials Damage and Soiling |
| C. | 1. | Materials DamageVIII-15a. Effects on MetalsVIII-16b. Effects on PaintVIII-17c. Effects on StoneVIII-18d. Effects on ElectronicsVIII-19 |
| | | a. Effects on Metals |
| | 2. | b. Effects on Paint VIII-17 c. Effects on Stone |
| | 2. | c. Effects on Stone |
| | 2. | d. Effects on Electronics VIII-19 |
| | 2. | |
| | 2. | Staff Considerations Pertaining to the Effects of PM on |
| | | Starr Considerations I creating to the Effects of I W on |
| | | Materials Damage VIII-19 |
| | 3. | Soiling |
| | 4. | Societal Costs VIII-22 |
| | | a. Soiling/Property Value VIII-22 |
| | | b. Soiling/Materials VIII-23 |
| | 5. | Staff Considerations Pertaining to the Effects of PM on |
| | | Soiling |
| D. | Summ | nary of Staff Conclusions and Recommendations on Secondary |
| | | QS |
| | | |
| APPENDIX | A | Considerations in Selecting Particle Size Cut Point for Fine |
| APPENDIX | _ | Particles |

| APPENDIX D | I. Hypothetical Mechanisms of Action for PM D-1 |
|------------|--|
| | II. Extrapolation of Results From Laboratory Studies to Those |
| | Of Epidemiologic Studies: Strength and Limitations Of |
| | Controlled Human and Animal Studies D-10 |
| APPENDIX E | Concentration-Response Relationships for Model Sensitivity |
| | Analysis in Risk Assessment |
| APPENDIX F | Sensitivity Analyses of Key Uncertainties in the Risk Assessment . F-1 |
| APPENDIX G | Measures of Visibility Impairment and Light Extinction G-1 |
| APPENDIX H | Clean Air Scientific Advisory Committee Closure Letters H-1 |

vii

LIST OF TABLES

| <u>Number</u> | <u>Pa</u> | <u>ige</u> |
|---------------|---|------------------|
| IV-1 | Particle Size Fraction Terminology Used in this Staff Paper IV | /-3a |
| IV-2 | Comparison of Ambient Fine and Coarse Mode Particles | /-4a |
| IV-3 | PM_{10} and $PM_{2.5}$ Regional Background Levels | ⁷ -13 |
| IV-4 | PM _{2.5} Concentrations in Selected Cities | 17a |
| IV-5 | Summary of PM_{10} Non-Attainment Areas by Source Type IV | ⁷ -19 |
| IV-6 | PM_{10} NAAQS Implementation Case Studies Summary IV- | 19a |
| V-1 | Modeled 24-Hr Regional Deposition for Measured Ambient Particle Size Distributions | V-4 |
| V-2 | Hypothesized Mechanisms of PM Toxicity | V-6 |
| V-3 | Estimated Mortality Increase Per 50 $\mu g/m^3$ Increase in 24-h PM_{10} Concentrations from U.S. Studies $\ldots \ldots V$ - | -13a |
| V-4 | Comparison of Total Mortality With Age- and Cause-Specific Mortality for Short-Term Exposure Studies | 13b |
| V-5 | Relative Risk Between the Most Polluted and Least Polluted Cities for Total Population and Former and Current Smokers in the Prospective Cohort Studies | -14a |
| V-6 | Estimated Increased Hospital Admissions for the Elderly Per 50 $\mu g/m^3$ Increase in 24-h PM_{10} Concentrations from U.S. and Canadian Studies $$. V- | ·20a |
| V-7 | Estimated Lung Function Changes and Respiratory Symptoms per 50 μ g/m³ Increase in 24-h PM $_{10}$ Concentrations from U.S. and Canadian Studies | -22a |
| V-8 | Morbidity Effects Estimates Per Increments in Annual Mean Levels of Fine/Thoracic Particle Indicators from U.S. and Canadian Studies V- | -26a |

viii

LIST OF TABLES (Cont'd.)

| <u>Number</u> | <u>Pag</u> | <u>e</u> |
|---------------|---|----------|
| V-9 | Qualitative Summary of Recent PM Community Epidemiologic Results for Short and Long-Term Exposure | 32 |
| V-10 | Quantitative Coherence of Acute Mortality and Hospitalization Studies V-5 | 7a |
| V-11 | Short-Term Exposure Epidemiological Studies Of Mortality Using Optical Fine Particle Indicators | 60 |
| V-12 | Fine Particle Indicator (PM $_{2.5}$, SO $_4$, H $^+$) Effects Studies from the U.S. and Canada | 0b |
| V-13 | Effect Estimates Per Increments in Annual Mean Levels of Fine/Thoracic Particle Indicators from U.S. and Canadian Studies V-61 | a |
| V-14 | Estimated Increase in Daily Mortality, 95% C1, and t Statistic by City and Combined Estimate Associated with a 10 μ g/m³ Increase in Particulate Mass Concentrations. Effect of Each Particle Mass Measure Associations Estimated Separately, Controlled for Long-Term Trends and Weather | 3a |
| VI-1 | Cities Examined in PM Risk Analysis VI | -6 |
| VI-2 | Selected Epidemiological Studies and Associated Relative Risk Estimates Used in Risk Analyses | 12 |
| VI-3 | Concentration-Response "Cutpoints" Examined in Uncertainty Analyses . VI- | 18 |
| VI-4 | Relevant Population Sizes for Philadelphia County and Southeast Los Angeles County | 22 |
| VI-5 | Baseline Health Effects Incidence Rates VI- | 23 |
| VI-6 | Estimated Annual Health Risks Associated with "As Is" PM Concentrations in Philadelphia County, September 1992-August 1993 (for base case assumptions) | 28 |

LIST OF TABLES (Cont'd.)

| <u>Number</u> | | <u>Page</u> |
|---------------|--|-------------|
| VI-7 | Estimated Annual Health Risks Associated with "As Is" PM Concentrations in Southeast Los Angeles County, 1995 (for base case assumptions) | VI-30 |
| VI-8 | Estimated Annual Health Risks Associated with Attainment of Current Standards in Southeast Los Angeles County, 1995 (for base case assumptions) | VI-33 |
| VI-9 | Summary of Selected Sensitivity Analyses on Estimates of Risk Associated with PM in Philadelphia County | VI-37 |
| VI-10 | Summary of Uncertainties Incorporated Into Integrated Uncertainty Analysis | VI-40 |
| VI-11a | Controlling Monitors for Rollbacks to Attain Alternative PM-2.5 Standards | VI-45 |
| VI-11b | Controlling Standards and Percent Rollbacks Necessary to Attain Alternative $PM_{2.5}$ Standards | VI-45 |
| VI-12a | Estimated Changes in Health Risks Associated with Meeting Alternative PM-2.5 Standards in Philadelphia County, September 1992 - August 1993 (for base case assumptions) | VI-46 |
| VI-12b | Estimated Changes in Health Risks Associated with Meeting Alternative PM-2.5 Standards in Philadelphia County, September 1992 - August 1993 (for base case assumptions) | VI-47 |
| VI-13a | Estimated Changes in Health Risks Associated with Meeting Alternative PM-2.5 Standards in Southeast Los Angeles County, 1995 (for base case assumptions) | VI-48 |
| VI-13b | Estimated Changes in Health Risks Associated with Meeting Alternative PM-2.5 Standards in Southeast Los Angeles County, 1995 (for base case assumptions) | VI-49 |
| VI-14 | Sensitivity Analysis: Effect of Alternative Rollback Methods on Mortality Estimates Short-term Exposure (Pooled Function) and Long- term Exposure PM-2.5 Mortality Functions. Philadelphia County, | |

| | September 1992-August 1993 | . VI-50 |
|--------|---|-------------|
| | LIST OF TABLES (Cont'd.) | |
| Number | | <u>Page</u> |
| VII-1 | Percentage of Counties Not Meeting Alternative PM_{10} Standards | . VII-8 |
| VII-2 | Predicted Percentage of Counties Not Meeting Alternative PM _{2.5} Standards | VII-26 |
| VII-3 | Predicted Comparison of Alternative Forms for a 24-Hour $PM_{2.5}$ Standard | VII-30 |
| VII-4 | Comparison of Alternative Forms for a 24-Hour PM_{10} Standard | VII-41 |
| VIII-1 | Comparison of Residential Visibility Valuation Study Results | VIII-3a |
| VIII-2 | Average Natural Background Levels of Aerosols and Light Extinction | VIII-6a |
| VIII-3 | Dry Particle Light Extinction Efficiency Values Used in 1996 Analysis of IMPROVE Data | VIII-9 |
| VIII-4 | Comparison of Total Light Extinction to Estimated Background Light Extinction for Several Eastern and Western Locations | /III-10b |
| VIII-5 | Visibility Model Results: Anthropogenic Light Extinction Budgets | /III-11a |
| VIII-6 | Percentage Contribution by Source Category to Fine Particle (and Precursor) Emissions in the East, Southwest, and Northwest | ⁄III-11b |
| VIII-7 | Percentage Contributions of Aerosol Constituents to Annual Average Total Light Extinction in the Washington, DC and Southern California Areas | VIII-12 |
| E-1 | Potential Concentration Cutpoints of Interest for Assessing the Sensitivity of Risk Estimates Derived from Short-Term Exposure Studies | . E-6a |

| E-2 | Relationship Between Relative Risk of Death and PM-10 in Utah Valley |
|--------|---|
| | LIST OF TABLES (Cont'd.) |
| Number | <u>Page</u> |
| E-3 | Potential Concentration Cutpoints of Interest for Assessing the Sensitivity of Risk Estimates Derived from Long-Term Exposure Studies E-10a |
| F-1a | Sensitivity Analysis: The Effect of Alternative Background Levels on Predicted Health Effects Associated with "As-Is" PM-10 Philadelphia County, September 1992-August 1993 |
| F-1b | Sensitivity Analysis: The Effect of Alternative Background Levels on Predicted Health Effects Associated with "As-Is" PM-2.5 Philadelphia County, September 1992-August 1993 |
| F-2 | Sensitivity Analysis: Effect of Alternative Rollback Methods on Predicted Health Effects of PM-2.5. Philadelphia County, September 1992-August 1993 |
| F-3a | Sensitivity Analysis: The Effect of Alternative Cutpoint Models on Predicted Health Effects Associated with "As-Is" PM-10. Slope Adjustment Method 1. Philadelphia County, September 1992-August 1993 F-8a |
| F-3b | Sensitivity Analysis: The Effect of Alternative Cutpoint Models on Predicted Health Effects Associated with "As-Is" PM-10. Slope Adjustment Method 2. Philadelphia County, September 1992-August 1993 F-8b |
| F-3c | Sensitivity Analysis: The Effect of Alternative Cutpoint Models on Predicted Health Effects Associated with "As-Is" PM-2.5. Slope Adjustment Method 1. Philadelphia County, September 1992-August 1993 F-8c |
| F-3d | Sensitivity Analysis: The Effect of Alternative Cutpoint Models on Predicted Health Effects Associated with "As-Is" PM-2.5. Slope Adjustment Method 2. Philadelphia County, September 1992-August 1993 F-8d |
| F-3e | Sensitivity Analysis: The Effect of Differing Cutpoints on Estimated Mortality Associated with Long-term Exposure to PM-2.5. Philadelphia County, September 1992-August 1993 F-8e |
| F-4 | Sensitivity Analysis: Effect of Combining Different Averaging Times |

| | in Pooled Short-Term Exposure Mortality Functions on Predicted Health Effects Associated with "As-Is" PM-10. Philadelphia County, September 1992-August 1993 | |
|---------------|--|-------------|
| | LIST OF TABLES (Cont'd.) | |
| <u>Number</u> | | <u>Page</u> |
| F-5a | Sensitivity Analysis: Effect of Copollutants. Relative Risks for Change of 50 $\mu g/m^3$ PM-10 or 25 $\mu g/m^3$ PM-2.5 | F-12a |
| F-5b | Sensitivity Analysis: Effect of Copollutants on Predicted Health Effects Associated with "As-Is" PM. Philadelphia County, September 199 August 1993 | |
| F-6 | Sensitivity Analysis: The Effect of Concentration-Response Function Slope on Estimated Mortality Associated with Long-term Exposure to PM-2.5. Philadelphia County, September 1992-August 1993 | F-14a |

xiii

LIST OF FIGURES

| <u>Number</u> | | <u>Page</u> |
|---------------|--|-------------|
| IV-1 | Idealized Distribution of Ambient Particulate Matter | . IV-2a |
| IV-2 | Distribution of Particles by Number, Surface Area, and Volume | . IV-2b |
| IV-3 | Major Constituents of $PM_{2.5}$, Coarse Fraction, and PM_{10} (CD, Figures 6-85a-c) | . IV-5a |
| IV-4 | Areas Designated Nonattainment for Particulates (PM-10) | . IV-8a |
| IV-5a | PM-10 Trend, 1988-1993 (Annual Arithmetic Mean) | . IV-9a |
| IV-5b | PM-10 Trend, 1988-1993 (90th Percentile) | . IV-9a |
| IV-6 | Fine Mass Concentration Derived from Nonurban IMPROVE/NESCAUM Networks | . IV-9b |
| IV-7 | United States Trend Maps for the 75th Percentile Extinction Coefficient. | IV-10a |
| IV-8 | Trends in Visibility and Sulfur Emissions in the Eastern U.S | IV-11a |
| IV-9 | Locations Where Community Epidemiology Studies Associating Short-Term PM Exposure with Mortality were Conducted in North America | IV-16a |
| V-1 | Human Respiratory Tract PM Deposition Fraction Versus Mass Median Aerodynamic Diameter (MMAD) with Two Different Geometric Standa Distributions | |
| V-2 | Relationship Between Relative Risk Per 50 $\mu\text{g/m}^3$ PM_{10} and Specific Causes of Mortality and Morbidity in Adults and Children $\ldots\ldots\ldots$ | . V-55a |
| V-3a | Relationship Between Relative Risk of Mortality Associated with PM-10 and Maximum Levels of SO_2 , CO , NO_2 , and $Ozone \dots \dots$ | . V-56a |
| V-3b | Relationship Between Relative Risk of Mortality Associated with PM ₁₀ and Mean Values of SO ₂ and NO ₂ | V-56b |

xiv

LIST OF FIGURES (Cont'd.)

| <u>Number</u> | | <u>Page</u> |
|---------------|--|-------------|
| V-4 | Relative Risks of Acute Mortality in the Six City Study, for Thoracic Particles (PM_{10} , PM_{15}), Fine Particles ($PM_{2.5}$) and Coarse Fraction Particles (PM_{15} - $PM_{2.5}$) | . V-63a |
| V-5 | Adjusted Relative Risks for Mortality are Plotted Against Each of Seven Long-Term Average Particle Indices in the Six City Study, from Largest Range (Total Suspended Particles, Upper Right) Through Sulfate and Nonsulfate Fine Particle Concentrations (Lower Left) | . V-65a |
| V-6 | Age-Sex-Race Adjusted Mortality Rates from ACS Study Plotted Against Mean Sulfate and TSP Levels for U.S. Metropolitan Areas (Pope, 1995) | . V-66a |
| V-7 | % of Children with < 85% Normal FVC vs. Annual Fine and Coarse Fraction Mass in 24 City Study | . V-67a |
| VI-1 | Major Components of Particulate Matter Health Risk Analysis | . VI-5 |
| VI-2 | Daily Average PM Concentration Frequencies Philadelphia County, September 1992 - August 1993 | . VI-8 |
| VI-3 | Daily Average PM-10 Concentrations for Southeast Los Angeles County, 1995 | . VI-9 |
| VI-4 | Daily Average PM-2.5 Concentration Frequencies for Southeast Los Angeles County, 1995 | . VI-10 |
| VI-5 | Schematic Representation of Alternative Interpretations of Reported Epidemiologic Relative Risk (RR) Findings with Regard to Possible Underlying PM Mortality Concentration-Response Functions (CD, Figure 13-5) | . VI-17 |
| VI-6 | Slope Adjustment Methods Used in Sensitivity and Uncertainty Analyses | s VI-19 |
| VI-7 | Effect of Several Uncertainties on Mortality Risk Associated With Short Term Exposure to PM-2.5 in Philadelphia County | |

LIST OF FIGURES (Cont'd.)

| <u>Number</u> | | <u>Page</u> |
|---------------|---|-------------|
| VI-8 | Effect of Several Uncertainties on Mortality Risk Associated With Short- Term Exposure to PM-2.5 After Meeting Current PM-10 Standards in Los Angeles County | VI-43 |
| VI-9 | Effect of Several Uncertainties on Reductions in Mortality Risk Associated With Short-Term Exposure to PM-2.5 Upon Attaining PM-2.5 Standards of 15 μ g/m³ Annual and 50 μ g/m³ Daily in Los Angeles County | VI-55 |
| VI-10 | Effect of Several Uncertainties on Reductions in Mortality Risk Associated With Short-Term Exposure to PM-2.5 Upon Meeting Alternative PM-2.5 Standards in Los Angeles County | VI-57 |
| VIII-1 | Average Light Extinction Coefficient (in Mm ⁻¹) for Each of the Reported Sites in the IMPROVE Network, 1992-1995 | VIII-7a |
| VIII-2 | Annual Average Visibility Impairment in Deciviews Calculated from Total Light Extinction (Rayleigh included), IMPROVE Network, 1992-1995 | VIII-7a |
| VIII-3 | Average $PM_{2.5}$ Mass Concentration (in $\mu g/m^3$) for Each Site in the IMPROVE Network, 1992-1995 | VIII-8a |
| VIII-4 | Average PM_{10} Mass Concentration (in $\mu g/m^3$) for Each Site in the IMPROVE Network, 1992-1995 | VIII-8a |
| VIII-5 | Fine Mass as a Percent of PM_{10} for Each Site in the IMPROVE Network, 1992-1995 | VIII-8b |
| VIII-6a | Average Winter Visibility Impairment in Deciviews Calculated from Total Light Extinction (Rayleigh included), IMPROVE Network, 1992-1995 | VIII-9a |
| VIII-6b | Average Spring Visibility Impairment in Deciviews Calculated from Total Light Extinction (Rayleigh included), IMPROVE Network, 1992-1995 | VIII-9a |
| VIII-7a | Average Summer Visibility Impairment in Deciviews Calculated from Total Light Extinction (Rayleigh included). IMPROVE Network. | |

| | 1992-1995 VIII-9b | | | | |
|---------------------------|--|--|--|--|--|
| LIST OF FIGURES (Cont'd.) | | | | | |
| <u>Number</u> | <u>Page</u> | | | | |
| VIII-7b | Average Autumn Visibility Impairment in Deciviews Calculated from Total Light Extinction (Rayleigh included), IMPROVE Network, 1992-1995 | | | | |
| VIII-8 | Spatial Variation in Average Relative Humidity and the Sulfate Humidity Correction Factor | | | | |
| VIII-9 | Perceptible Change in Visibility as a Function of Fine Mass Concentration | | | | |
| C-1 | PM-10 Air Quality Concentrations, 1992-94 | | | | |
| C-2 | PM-10 Air Quality Concentrations, 1992-94 | | | | |
| C-3 | Regions Used in Air Quality Analyses in this Staff Paper | | | | |
| E-1 | Relationship Between Relative Risk of Death and PM-10 in Birmingham E-6b | | | | |
| E-2 | Relationship Between Relative Risk of Death and PM-10 in Utah Valley . E-6b | | | | |
| E-3 | Relationship Between Relative Risk of Death and PM-10 in the Utah Valley | | | | |
| E-4 | Relationship Between Relative Risk of Pneumonia Admissions Among the Elderly and PM-10 in Birmingham | | | | |
| E-5 | Relationship Between Ischemic Heart Disease Admissions Among the Elderly and PM-10 | | | | |
| E-6 | Relationship Between Relative Risk of Pneumonia Admission Among the Elderly and PM-10 in Detroit | | | | |
| E-7 | Relationship Between the Odds of Cough Incidence Versus PM-10 Concentration from the Six City Study | | | | |
| E-8 | Relationship of the Odds of Lower Respiratory Symptoms Incidence Versus PM-10 Concentration from the Six City Study | | | | |

xvii

| E-9 | Relationship Between Mortality Risk Ratios and Inhalable Particles $(PM_{15/10})$ in the Six City Study | E-10b |
|---------------|--|-------------|
| <u>Number</u> | | <u>Page</u> |
| E-10 | Relationship Between Mortality Risk Rate Ratios and PM-2.5 in the Six City Study | E-10b |
| E-11 | Relationship Between Adjusted Mortality and PM-2.5 in the American Cancer Society Study | E-10c |
| F-1 | Distribution of $PM_{2.5}$ Concentrations and of Estimated Mortality Risks from Short-Term Exposures in Philadelphia County | . F-5 |
| F-2 | Comparison of Smoothed Nonlinear and Linear Mathematical Models for Relative Risk of Total Mortality Associated with Short-Term TSP Exposure | F-10 |
| G-1 | Visual Range and Extinction Coefficient as a Function of Haziness Expressed in Deciview | G-4a |